

Notice of Allowability

Application No.

09/470,360

Examiner

Taylor Victor Oh

Applicant(s)

HORAN ET AL.

Art Unit

1625

-- The MAILING DATE of this communication appears on the cover sheet with the correspondence address--

All claims being allowable, PROSECUTION ON THE MERITS IS (OR REMAINS) CLOSED in this application. If not included herewith (or previously mailed), a Notice of Allowance (PTOL-85) or other appropriate communication will be mailed in due course. **THIS NOTICE OF ALLOWABILITY IS NOT A GRANT OF PATENT RIGHTS.** This application is subject to withdrawal from issue at the initiative of the Office or upon petition by the applicant. See 37 CFR 1.313 and MPEP 1308.

1. ☒ This communication is responsive to 1/8/2004.
2. ☒ The allowed claim(s) is/are 6-11, renumbered as claims 1-6.
3. ☐ The drawings filed on _____ are accepted by the Examiner.
4. ☐ Acknowledgment is made of a claim for foreign priority under 35 U.S.C. § 119(a)-(d) or (f).
 - a) ☐ All b) ☐ Some* c) ☐ None of the:
 1. ☐ Certified copies of the priority documents have been received.
 2. ☐ Certified copies of the priority documents have been received in Application No. _____.
 3. ☐ Copies of the certified copies of the priority documents have been received in this national stage application from the International Bureau (PCT Rule 17.2(a)).

* Certified copies not received: _____.

Applicant has THREE MONTHS FROM THE "MAILING DATE" of this communication to file a reply complying with the requirements noted below. Failure to timely comply will result in ABANDONMENT of this application.
THIS THREE-MONTH PERIOD IS NOT EXTENDABLE.

5. ☐ A SUBSTITUTE OATH OR DECLARATION must be submitted. Note the attached EXAMINER'S AMENDMENT or NOTICE OF INFORMAL PATENT APPLICATION (PTO-152) which gives reason(s) why the oath or declaration is deficient.
6. ☒ CORRECTED DRAWINGS (as "replacement sheets") must be submitted.
 - (a) ☒ including changes required by the Notice of Draftsperson's Patent Drawing Review (PTO-948) attached
 - 1) ☐ hereto or 2) ☒ to Paper No./Mail Date 1/31/01.
 - (b) ☐ including changes required by the attached Examiner's Amendment / Comment or in the Office action of Paper No./Mail Date _____.

Identifying indicia such as the application number (see 37 CFR 1.84(c)) should be written on the drawings in the front (not the back) of each sheet. Replacement sheet(s) should be labeled as such in the header according to 37 CFR 1.121(d).
7. ☐ DEPOSIT OF and/or INFORMATION about the deposit of BIOLOGICAL MATERIAL must be submitted. Note the attached Examiner's comment regarding REQUIREMENT FOR THE DEPOSIT OF BIOLOGICAL MATERIAL.

Attachment(s)

1. ☐ Notice of References Cited (PTO-892)
2. ☒ Notice of Draftsperson's Patent Drawing Review (PTO-948)
3. ☐ Information Disclosure Statements (PTO-1449 or PTO/SB/08), Paper No./Mail Date _____
4. ☐ Examiner's Comment Regarding Requirement for Deposit of Biological Material
5. ☐ Notice of Informal Patent Application (PTO-152)
6. ☐ Interview Summary (PTO-413), Paper No./Mail Date _____
7. ☐ Examiner's Amendment/Comment
8. ☒ Examiner's Statement of Reasons for Allowance
9. ☐ Other _____

Reasons for Allowance

1. The following is an examiner's statement of reasons for allowance:

the close references for the current invention are Papa et al (US 5,231,222) and Spiske et al (US 5,248,427).

Papa et al teaches a process of producing an ester compound by reacting an alcohol having an 2 to 5 carbon atoms with a carboxylic acid with 1 to 4 carbon atoms in the presence of an esterification catalyst in the following steps:

- a. removing the reaction products such as ester and water from the reactor by distillation;
- b. forming a water-ester azeotrope by the addition of water (e.g. 25-30%);
and
- c. separating the water-ester azeotrope in a separate vessel to isolate the desired ester .

Spiske et al discloses a process for removing water by means of a membrane from the reaction mixture obtained from the preparation of carboxylic esters by the reaction of alcohols and carboxylic acids in the presence of an acidic catalyst. Furthermore, in the process , the removal of water from not only a mixture of water and an alcohol, but also a carboxylic acid or a carboxylic ester can be conducted by the membrane.

Art Unit: 1625

However, the instant invention differs from the prior art in that none of the prior art teach a portion of the organic phase rich in ethyl acetate from the condensed azeotrope to be recycled to the reaction zone or to the distillation apparatus as an azeotrope.

Therefore, applicants' claimed subject matter would not have been obvious to the person with an ordinary skill in the art.

Any comments considered necessary by applicant must be submitted no later than the payment of the issue fee and, to avoid processing delays, should preferably accompany the issue fee. Such submissions should be clearly labeled "Comments on Statement of Reasons for Allowance."

Any inquiry concerning the communication after allowance such as sending all post-allowance correspondence should be directed to " Box Issue Fee" or faxed directly to PUBS at 703-305-8755. This will expedite the process of these papers.

Information regarding the status of an application may be obtained from the Patent Application Information Retrieval (PAIR) system. Status information for published applications may be obtained from either Private PAIR or Public PAIR. Status information for unpublished applications is available through Private PAIR only. For more information about the PAIR system, see <http://pair-direct.uspto.gov>. Should you have questions on access to the Private PAIR system, contact the Electronic Business Center (EBC) at 866-217-9197 (toll-free).

myh sh
3/19/24

B *2*

BA K. TRINH
PRIMARY EXAMINER
GROUP 1200

1625